Mindfulness & Resiliency for Primary Care Teams

Finding Our Way Back to Meaning and Presence in Medicine
PCMH June 20, 2014

Joe (George) Dreher, MD,
MMC Department of Medical Education
MMC Provider Health & Resilience Committee
“This week, on ‘The Amazing Race to Enlightenment,’ can Jim and Suzy achieve right mindfulness? And will Barb and Candy be eliminated for relentless clinging to the self?”
What we will consider …

- Origins of internal & external stress and Burnout & its impact on us / our work
- Barriers to self-care (external and internal)
- Resiliency tools
  - Mindfulness as one tool
    - Understanding Monkey Mind
    - Core Mindfulness concepts
- Research on impact of Mindfulness / Self-care
- Engaging your Organization
- Engaging Yourself
Chasing meaning is better for your health than avoiding discomfort.

Kelly McGonigal, PhD
Self-love, my liege, is not so vile a sin as self-neglect.

Henry V, Act 2, scene 4
How actively do you take care of yourself?

DO YOU TAKE BETTER CARE OF OTHERS THAN YOURSELF?
Consider your own self-care efforts …

“The handle on your recliner does not qualify as an exercise machine.”
“I have metal fillings in my teeth. My refrigerator magnets keep pulling me into the kitchen. That’s why I can’t lose weight!”
What is enough?

(Stuff / work / activities / money ...)

SO, COSMO... WHAT HAS MADE YOU SO MISERABLE?

MY PURSUIT OF HAPPINESS.
Two sides to the (self) coin …

Psychological Strengths

- Thoroughness
- Commitment
- Doing everything “right”
- Healthy skepticism
- Altruism, stoicism, hard work
- Caring
- Rationality
- Self-criticism

Psychological Vulnerabilities

- Over-compulsiveness
- Over-commitment
- Inability to admit mistakes
- Need for certainty
- Neglecting self-care and family
- Compassion fatigue
- Emotional distance
- Self-deprecation
When was your last stress test?

Well, I went to work yesterday.
Work may be draining…

- Long hours
- Many meetings
- Constant interruptions
- Deadline pressures
- Fewer resources
- Uncertainty / insecurity
- Rapidly changing health care system
- Less control & greater expectations
- Silo work environment / disconnection
- Maybe some stresses at home too …
We might sometimes feel like a …

- Robot
- Sprinter
- Waitress/waiter
- State Trooper
- Trapeze artist
- Tow truck operator
- Air traffic controller
- Assembly line worker
Anxiety Response Curve

Your Performance Level

Your Level of Anxiety
Chronic stress => behavioral ruts

Too much stress / unrealistic expectations =>

fall into automatic / default routines rather than flexibly responding =>

responses less corrective =>

become more rigid =>

more stress =>

etc. etc. ....

Angier  Brain as Co-conspirator in Vicious Stress Loop NYT 8.2009
Chronic stress => physical dis-ease

- Hypertension => multiple health risks
- GI upset / Headaches
- Chronic endocrine stress patterns & increased body-wide inflammation
- More distractibility / self-centered thinking / decreased decision making ability / concrete thinking
- Increased pain response / more medically unexplained symptoms …
- Etc. etc. …
Symptoms of Burnout

- **Emotional exhaustion**
  - Emotionally overextended and exhausted by work

- **Depersonalization**
  - Negative, cynical attitude, treating others (peers / patients / clients / customers) as objects

- **Sense of low personal accomplishment**
  - Feelings of incompetence, inefficiency and inadequacy
Burnout by Medical Specialty 2012

- 7288 physicians and 3442 working U.S. adults compared using Maslach Burnout Inventory
  - Overall 45.8% of physicians reported at least one of the three symptoms of burnout

- Compared to High School graduates the Odds Ratio for Burn-Out in higher education gaps was:
  - Bachelor’s degree OR = 0.80 \( P = 0.48 \)
  - Master’s degree OR = 0.71 \( P = .01 \)
  - PhD / professional degree OR = 0.64 \( P = .04 \)
  - MD or DO degree OR = 1.36 \( P <.001 \)

- Highest rates amongst those in front lines of care
  - Emergency Medicine \( \sim 65\% \)
  - Gen. Int. Med. \( \sim 56\% \)
  - Neurology \( \sim 55\% \)
  - Family Medicine \( \sim 54\% \)

Some Risk Factors for Burnout

- Overwork
- Reduced self-care
- Reduced awareness of one’s emotional needs
- Limited support / relationships with others
- Difficult communications
- Inability to live up to one’s own standards
  - “Imposter syndrome” / not being enough / perfectionism
- Feeling of depression / grief / guilt in response to losses (at work or “outside” life)
- Erosion of values / meaning in work
Burnout undermines work function

- Reduction in commitment & idealism
- Reduction of meaning in work (cynicism)
- Increasing sense of guilt / unworthiness
- Loss of direction / purpose

Shanafelt  CMA Physician Health conference 2012
Risks to the Provider

- Risk of chemical misuse increased
- Physician rates of depression ~ general population
- Physician relative rates of suicide:
  - Male physicians ~ 1.1 to 3.4 x
  - Female physicians ~ 2.5 to 5.7 x
- Stigma / licensing fears / reduced workplace support all contribute to disparity

Center JAMA 289:3;161 2003
Burnout Risks to Patients

- Reduced access to care
- Reduced patient satisfaction
- Reduced patient compliance
- Physician prescribing habits
- Greater physician emotional exhaustion associated with lower knowledge base
- Burned out residents did not later “catch-up” to peer knowledge base

- Med Care 23:85,
- Health Psych 12:93,
- JGIM 15:122
- JAMA 306:952
Improvements in patient care associated with increased _____ (p<0.05 or better):

- Provider work control => better diabetes care quality

- Emphasis on information and communication => better HTN quality care and overall quality

- Values alignment => better DM care quality & fewer prevention errors
Burnout risks to the organization

- Morale diminished
- Increased errors
- Corrective costs increase
- Reduced productivity
- Less creativity / flexibility
- Work ethic decreased / “presenteeism”
- Attrition rates increase => costly new hires, training and ramp-up time (for any team member)
Reactive rat race ...
Mindful & meaningful engagement ...
Seeking Resilience

Within ourselves and our organizations
Personal satisfaction & resilience arise from:

- Adopting a **healthy philosophical attitude** toward life
- Finding **support**
- Engaging and finding **meaning**
- Developing **healthy relationships**
- **Taking care of yourself**
- Cultivating **self-awareness**

*Source: Shanafelt TD et al. 2003 and 2005, Horowitz 2003*
Responses to life challenges

- **Unhealthy reactions** (reflex reacting)
  - Unskillful behaviors you feel “you can’t keep yourself” from doing

- **“Survival skills”** (habits)
  - Help you get through a tough time, but may be destructive if primary (avoid being *proud* of these)

- **Growth; healthy coping and changing** (*flexibly responding*)
  - Important to your development in work and as a person
  - Builds resilience
Growth

“Experience is not what happens to you,
Experience is *what you do with* what happens to you.”

Aldus Huxley
“You Must Be Present to Win”

- Where are you right now?
  - How much of yourself is in the future?
  - How much is in the past?
  - How much is here?

- Remember a time when you were fully present.
  - What was different about yourself then?

- What gets in the way of being fully present?
Awareness ...  

Solve the whodunit puzzle
Monkey Mind

Unconscious automated proliferation & expansion…
You start with any sensory input – say visual …
The image enters your mind...
"Get your facts first, and then you can distort them as much as you please."

Mark Twain
Mindfulness

Moment-to-moment purposeful attentiveness to one’s own mental processes during every day activities with the goal of living with clarity and compassion.

©Mindful Practice Programs, University of Rochester, 2010

Epstein RM 1999
The Core of Mindfulness

Moment to moment

nonjudgmental

awareness

of whatever arises
Mindfulness as a resilience tool

- Increasing awareness of:
  - our mental processes,
  - our biases, associations and judgments,
  - impact of listening more attentively / generously

- Mindfulness reduces:
  - mental proliferations
  - chasing after impossible expectations
  - endless suffering through self-judgment
  - exhausting ourselves working ineffectively
Mindfulness as a resilience tool

- This improves our:
  - understanding
  - emotional / mental flexibility
  - acting with greater skill and compassion.

- Thereby promoting:
  - perspective / clarity
  - wiser choices and intentions
  - deeper care of self & others
One can be Mindful of:

- **The body**
  - *breath*, contact, movements, technical skills
  - bodily sensations as a clue to state of mind

- **Feelings and emotions**
  - pleasant and unpleasant sensations (the “sinking feeling”)
  - sadness, anxiety, heaviness, acceptance

- **Thoughts, attitudes, beliefs**
  - state of alertness/attentiveness/distractedness
  - “holding on”/“letting go”
  - cognitive processes (decision-making, “reflection”)

©Mindful Practice Programs, University of Rochester, 2010
Promoting lasting change: 3 Important Variables

- **Task Specific**
- **Challenging**
- **Repetition**

“Sweet Spot” for Change
Mindfulness Impact on Working in a High-Stress Environment

- 3 groups of HR personnel tested on completing complex tasks in a very distracting/multitasking environment then:
  - Gp1) completed 8 week MBSR course then tested again
  - Gp 2) wait listed, then re-tested, then completed 8 week MBSR course and retested for a third time
  - Gp 3) 8 week body relaxation training then retested

- Only those trained in meditation:
  - Had increased daily mindfulness and attention to environment
  - Stayed on assigned tasks longer / made fewer task switches
  - Had less negative emotions/fatigue-inertia after task completion
  - Improved memory for tasks performed (as did “relaxers”)

Mindful Communication: Bringing Intention, Attention, and Reflection into Clinical Practice


Group of long-term physicians from across specialties completing a program on Mindful Practice and monitored over the following 10 months

©Mindful Practice Programs, University of Rochester, 2010
Training associated changes in well-being

- **Burnout:**
  - Emotional Exhaustion \( r = 0.62 \) \( p < .001 \)
  - Depersonalization \( r = 0.45 \) \( p < .001 \)
  - Personal Accomplishment \( r = 0.44 \) \( p < .001 \)

- **Mood:**
  - Total Mood Disturbance \( r = 0.69 \) \( p < .001 \)
  - Depression \( r = 0.55 \) \( p < .001 \)
  - Anger \( r = 0.76 \) \( p < .001 \)
  - Fatigue \( r = 0.81 \) \( p < .001 \)
Three groups of Mayo clinic Int. Med. faculty

- Non-study group
- Study gp given 90 minutes protected time qowk
  - Control gp could use as they wished
  - Intervention gp divided into small gps of 6 – 8 + trained facilitator with sessions exploring work-life balance / medical mistakes / resiliency … => fostering sense of community & promote personal and professional growth

- Well-being surveys q 3 mo.
- Initial 3 mo. report at AMA/CMA/BMA mtg 10.12 – year long evaluation being published
Mayo Clinic Peer Support > Time Off in Prevention of Burnout – Changes at three mo.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Non-Study</th>
<th>Control</th>
<th>Intervention</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Meaning from work</td>
<td>-13.4 pts</td>
<td>-6.3 pts</td>
<td>+6.3 pts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High Emotional Exhaustion</td>
<td>+4.3 pts</td>
<td>-5.3 pts</td>
<td>-20.4 pts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Burnout</td>
<td>+4.9 pts</td>
<td>-13.8 pts</td>
<td>-25.8 pts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empowerment from Work</td>
<td></td>
<td>+0.8 pts</td>
<td>+2.6 pts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P = 0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depersonalization / callousness</td>
<td></td>
<td>+0.8 pts</td>
<td>-15.5 pts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P = 0.01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Training in (+) outlook improves function / counters culture of (-) anxiety

- Exercise (Babyck et al 2007)
- Meditation (Dweck, 2007)
- Journaling (Slater & Peenebaker 20006)
- Random Acts of Kindness (Lyubonoursky 2005)
- Seeking 3 New Gratitudes per day * (Emmons & McCullough 2003)

TED.com – Shawn Achor - Creating positive change
“Manage Your Energy, Not Your Time”

- Trialed in financial /automotive/electronics firms
- Programs of mutually reinforcing personal training:
  - Physical / Nutritional
  - Emotional Energy
  - Mental Energy
  - Spiritual Energy
- Plus organizational support of these efforts
- Participants compared to controls over the next year had:
  - Revenues increased 13 to 20 %
  - Relationships with clients improved in 68%
  - Better focused on and aware of what is important in their work (& lives)

Quality and Duration of Resiliency Efforts

- Seventeen person-directed intervention studies => 82% caused significant reductions in burnout and/or its risk factors lasting up to 6 months
- One organizational effort associated with significant reduction in burnout with some effects lasting up to one year
- Six combined interventions all had significant reductions in burnout with 80% of effects lasting up to a year

Awa, W L  Burnout Prevention: A review of intervention programs  *Pt Educ Counseling* 2010
Possible personal directions…

- Optimize career fit
- Enhance skills for difficult tasks esp. communication
  - Generous listening / conflict management / delivering bad news
- Build Resilience strategies & skills
  - Self-compassion
  - Cognitive, behavioral, mindfulness interventions
- Identifying your values & how they resonate with work
  - Though reflection / peer-peer conversations (Meaning In Medicine Gp)
- Integrating values into work & personal life
  - Mindfulness in Leadership Group
  - *Personal Mindfulness* – investigate reactions / automatic thoughts

Shannafelt  ICPH 2012
Regehr, C et al Interventions to reduce the Consequences of Stress in Physicians J Nerv Mental Dis 2014
Work life “Satisfaction Metrics”

- Workload
- Autonomy / control
- Rewards / pursuing mastery
- Community (peers/ staff quality / office design …)
- Fairness
- Values / meaning

-Dunn, M p Meeting the Imperative to Improve Physician Well-Being: Assessment of an Innovative Program J Gen Inter Med 2007
Personal work life needs ⇔ workplace offerings

- Emotional status a total of these metrics.
  - varying individual relative importance for each item in overall balance

- Better the match, better the levels of active engagement in work.

- Greater the mis-match, the greater the chance of burnout / disengagement.

Collaborative self-care at work

Balancing demands/stressors via:

- Increasing work control / autonomy
- Increasing support / peer-to-peer connection
- Flexible / part-time work
- Leaders modeling work-home balance & values
- Reducing “culture of endurance”
- Clearly articulating and aligning values
- Opportunities for Mastery and Meaning

Linzer Acad Med 2009,
Saleh Clin Orthoped Res 2009,
Dunn J Gen Intern Med 2007,
Vivers Can J Ophth 2008
Engaging with your workplace …

- Education on the impacts on quality / safety / turnover costs / efficiency …

- Consider employee workload / efficiency / autonomy / work-home life integration / meaning in work

- Actively collaborate with administration on all employee resilience toward mutually beneficial goals focusing on patient care

-Shanafelt  CMA Physician Health conference 2012
Some possible Workplace directions

- Level playing field volunteer resiliency committee
- Trainings in communication / conflict resolutions
- Peer support / counseling / coaching
- Support for those in crisis
- New hire orientation & support
- Professional Development / Sabbaticals
- Resiliency training  {Mindful Practice courses / MBSR}
- Team & Techno-work  (Sinsky Finding the Joy In Practice Ann Fm Med  2013)
- Ongoing evaluation and innovation  (Dunn P M Meeting the Imperative to Improve Physician Well-Being J Gen Intern Med 2007)
Personal Home Practice

- Consider setting an intention for the day each morning.

- Each evening take a few moments to consider what in your day was *inspiring*, was *intriguing*, was *surprising*. After some practice you will begin to notice these moments as they occur in your day and re-connect with what is meaningful in your work.

- Seek & follow meaning / purpose in your life.

©Mindful Practice Programs, University of Rochester, 2010
Summary

1. Personal meaning & values are key
2. Resilience efforts benefits you, the people you care for and the organization you work for.
3. Resilience is best achieved if all levels of the organization work together
4. Research has shown such change positively impacts all levels
5. Change takes time and ongoing work
Prairie Dog Pauses …
Vocation

Vocation does not mean a goal that I pursue. It means a calling that I hear.

Before I can tell my life what I want to do with it, I must listen to my life telling me who I am.

I must listen for the truths and values at the heart of my own identity, not the standards by which I must live, but the standards by which I cannot help but live if I am living my own life.

Parker Palmer
You can be 10% happier …